



Mid-Term Review

WaSH Support for Rohingya Refugees and Vulnerable Local Communities in Cox's Bazar District

for
SDC and Danida
by
Lars Mikkell Johannessen and Pranab Kumar Panday

November, 2020

Acronyms

| | |
|-------------|--|
| ADP | Annual Development Program |
| APA | Annual Performance Assessment |
| BIDS | Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies |
| BBS | Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics |
| BDT | Bangladesh Taka |
| BRAC | Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee |
| CBO | Community Based Organization |
| CO | Community Organizer |
| CSO | Civil Society Organization |
| DAC | Development Assistance Committee (OECD) |
| Danida | Danish International Development Assistance |
| DP | Development Partner |
| DPHE | Department of Public Health Engineering |
| EALG | Efficient and Accountable Local Governance Program |
| GoB | Government of Bangladesh |
| GPS | Global Positioning System |
| HYSAWA | Hygiene, Sanitation and Water Supply Company |
| LGD | Local Government Division |
| LGI | Local Government Institution |
| M&E | Monitoring and Evaluation |
| MLGRD&C | Ministry of Local Government, Rural Development and Cooperatives |
| MTR | Mid-term Review |
| MD | Managing Director |
| NGO | Non-Government Organization |
| NILG | National Institute of Local Government |
| NOA | Notification of Award |
| PBG | Performance-based Block Grant |
| PFM | Public Financial Management |
| PKSF | Palli Karma Sahayak Foundation |
| PPA | Public Procurement Act (2006) |
| PPR | Public Procurement Rules (2008) |
| The Project | “WaSH Support for Rohingya Refugees and Vulnerable Local Communities in Cox’s Bazar District”, implemented by HYSAWA |
| RRR | Refugee Relief & Repatriation Commissioner, Cox’s Bazar |
| SDC | Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation |
| SDG | Sustainable Development Goal |
| TA | Technical Assistance |
| TW | Tube Well |
| UNDP | United Nations Development Programme |
| UNO | Upazila Nirbahi (Executive) Officer |
| UP | Union Parishad |
| UZP | Upazila Parishad |
| WaSH | Water, Sanitation and Hygiene |
| WATSAN | Water and Sanitation |
| WB | World Bank |
| WS | ward shova |
| WHO | World Health Organization |

Table of contents

| | |
|--|----|
| Acronyms..... | 2 |
| Table of contents..... | 3 |
| Executive Summary..... | 4 |
| Recommendations..... | 6 |
| 1 Introduction and Background | 8 |
| 1.1 Introduction..... | 8 |
| 1.2 Background..... | 8 |
| 1.3 Methodology and approach..... | 9 |
| 2 Relevance and Coherence | 10 |
| 2.1 Relevance overall..... | 10 |
| 2.2 Relevance of support to Rohingya Camps..... | 11 |
| 2.3 Coherence | 12 |
| 3 Performance | 13 |
| 3.1 Effectiveness | 13 |
| 3.2 Efficiency..... | 15 |
| 4 Impact | 16 |
| 5 Sustainability..... | 17 |
| 6 Management Arrangements..... | 19 |
| 6.1 HYSAWA Management and monitoring..... | 19 |
| 6.2 HYSAWAs Governing Board..... | 19 |
| 6.3 Budget Analysis and Financial Management | 20 |
| 7 Lessons learned..... | 20 |
| 8 Conclusion and recommendations | 21 |
| 8.1 Conclusion | 21 |
| 8.2 Recommendations..... | 22 |
| Annexes..... | 24 |
| Annex 1: SDC Assessment Grid for the DAC Criteria..... | 25 |
| Annex 2: Application of the OECD DAC criteria to the MTR | 29 |
| Annex 3: List of people met..... | 30 |
| Annex 4: Selected Quotations from Focus Group Interviews | 31 |

Executive Summary

This Mid-Term Review (MTR) of “*WaSH Support for Rohingya Refugees and Vulnerable Local Communities in Cox’s Bazar District*”, commissioned by SDC was carried out from 1 October to 15 November 2020. Due to Covid-19, meetings were arranged in virtual meeting rooms. In addition, a short field visit was made to Cox’s Bazar.

The Project has been supported by SDC and Danida since November 2018 with USD8.33 million for a three-year period ending November 2022. The goal of the Project is to ***improve the health conditions of vulnerable host communities and Rohingya refugees through empowering LGIs in addressing Water, Sanitation and Hygiene problems in Cox’s Bazar.***

The MTR team found that the Project support to Cox’s Bazar remains relevant in host communities, where HYSAWA is one of few organizations with substantial funding. The Project contributes to achieving GoB targets in WaSH and SDG targets for Goal 3 - *Good health and well-being*, Goal 6 - *Clean water and sanitation* and Goal 16 - *Peace, justice and strong institutions*. In the Rohingya refugee camps, an urban-like setting, the Project is not relevant because 28 other WaSH partners provide substantial funding following an emergency and urban like approach that is much different from the current project’s participatory rural approach.

The Project is in accordance with SDC's focus on providing better WaSH services to the poorer segments of host communities. The Project is strong in public participation and is using the established local government structure to work directly with LGIs. In organizing ward shova meetings, the Project works jointly with EALG project. At present, project coordination with Department of Public Health Engineering, the nodal department responsible for WaSH, is limited, but actions have been taken to remedy this.

The Project is managed well, and the overall performance is assessed to be effective and efficient. At outcome level, targets are generally being met. At output level targets are being met or exceeded. Upazilas now have the tools and processes to deal with tenders more transparently but have yet to consolidate their newly acquired capacity. Union Parishad representatives are gaining confidence and are now able to provide better services to their constituencies. Capacity development on these committees could assist attaining more long-term sustainability of WaSH as these people may remain engaged in overseeing WaSH related activities beyond HYSAWA support.

The project delivers cost effective outputs and outcomes. For example, it delivers water wells 6 – 34 % more cost efficiently and school and public sanitation almost 50% more cost efficiently than comparable organizations in Bangladesh.

The Project has contributed to impact at the local level by contributing to a significant reduction in diarrhea cases – in targeted communities the cases have been reduced by as much as 50%. The number of people (households) engaging in open defecation has been reduced from 3% to 1% and people’s satisfaction of LGIs WaSH service has increased from 42% to 79%. GPS tracking

and mapping has contributed to more open and transparent governance and could increase even more, if all Government and other organizations supported WaSH will apply the GPS tracking system.

The Project has been successful in getting the LGI representatives involved in direct service delivery. LGIs have engaged enthusiastically with the Project and devoted staff has worked closely with project personnel, but the capacity is still to be consolidated as staff has not yet been able to repeatedly apply and demonstrate their acquired skills. It is unlikely that the developed capacity will be sustained without further support and more time for LGIs in practice to demonstrate their ability to plan, budget, and involve public consultation in decision making.

Gender balance in participatory planning could be improved from the current ratio of 1 woman per 5 men participating in planning processes. And although the 10% self-contribution is useful in generating ownership of installed WaSH facilities, it results in extremely poor and disadvantaged people being largely excluded from getting access to individual facilities.

When project funding stops the LGIs do not have funding or internal income to continue the high level of WaSH provided through the Project. Internal revenue collection of the UPs in Bangladesh is low and most UPs in the country have inadequate resources to discharge their responsibilities. There is no indication to suggest that Government funds to WaSH will reach the magnitude of HYSAWA support in near future. Support to WaSH in host communities will therefore continue to depend on external support through HYSAWA or other organizations. With no prospect of support from local or central government, HYSAWA will continue to rely on external funding. HYSAWA is therefore, jointly with LGD, working on the possibility to get a budget code that will allow projects to be awarded from the Government of Bangladesh and access to funds from e.g. ADB, World Bank and JICA.

The Maintenance Fund for WaSH established by HYSAWA nationwide for facilities installed by HYSAWA, with a capital of BDT20 million, is not widely known to WaSH beneficiaries in the Project area and hence installed WaSH facilities may not receive the required long-term maintenance support.

In conclusion the MTR team find that the Project implementation in Cox's Bazar is satisfactory to highly satisfactory, although there are concerns about the sustainability of the interventions. HYSAWA manages the Project well and has appropriate procedures in place.

The Project is effective in implementation, it is likely to achieve its targeted results and its objectives. It delivers cost efficient interventions compared to others in the same area and delivers according to budget and plans except in Rohingya refugee camps. WaSH support to Rohingya refugee camps is provided by a large and diverse range of agencies. These exhaust the absorption capacity of the recipient communities and there is, therefore, no room for HYSAWA's approach to WaSH.

More time and work are needed to sustain WaSH in the Project area. LGIs' have been trained, but their capacity needs to be consolidated by more and repeated hands-on experience. It is unlikely that the current developed capacity will be sustained without further support and more

time for LGIs in practice to demonstrate their ability to plan, budget, and involve public consultation in decision making. The poorest and disadvantaged people in the communities are largely excluded from the Project and a strategy is needed to include these people.

Recommendations

Based on the findings of the MTR, the team recommends the following:

1. SDC approves a no-cost extension of project implementation by one year to appropriately sustain developed capacity with both LGIs and with local communities and to ensure appropriate exit of the Project.
2. SDC and Danida recognize and acknowledge that other organizations are better placed to deliver WaSH support in the conditions currently prevailing in Rohingya camps and therefore adjust Outcome 2 to read: *Targeted men, women, boys and girls in host communities enjoy effective, sufficient and continuous water, sanitation services and hygiene promotion.*
3. HYSAWA prepares, urgently, a specific strategy for exit of HYSAWA in Cox's Bazar with focus on:
 - a) enhancing and sustaining already achieved capacity developed with LGIs to ensure that they are capable in undertaking transparent procedures and participatory approaches for future WaSH installations, which could include repetition of training and hands-on supervision
 - b) meeting current targets of water and sanitation installations
 - c) facilitating, where possible, a higher rate of women's involvement in planning and decision making
 - d) developing and implementing a strategy/policy to ensure that WaSH services can be made available also for extreme poor and disadvantaged families without a 10% self-contribution, e.g., applying in-kind contribution
 - e) enhance raising the awareness of the HYSAWA Maintenance Fund for project recipients in Cox's Bazar.
 - f) facilitating enhanced transparency of WaSH in Cox's Bazar, e.g., through the WaSH coordination group in Cox's Bazar, by advocating for an expansion of the GPS tracking system to include all national and international supported WaSH installations in Cox's Bazar.
 - g) reallocating budget between outcome 2 and outcome 1 to still achieve output targets and make a no-cost extension of the Project for approx. 1 year possible and focus this year on enhanced capacity development, especially of LGIs.
4. HYSAWA establishes linkages with DPHE's WaSH work including clear linkages with the SDC WaSH project in Cox's Bazar.

1 Introduction and Background

1.1 Introduction

This report documents the Mid-Term Review (MTR) of *“WaSH Support for Rohingya Refugees and Vulnerable Local Communities in Cox’s Bazar District”*, in the following referred to as the Project, is commissioned by the Swiss Agency for Development Cooperation (SDC).

The MTR was carried out from 1 October to 15 November 2020, and due to Covid-19 largely as a virtual mission with a short field visit to Cox’s Bazar by the national consultant between 5 and 7 October 2020. The MTR team consisted of Lars Mikkell Johannessen, International consultant, and Pranab Kumar Panday, National consultant.

1.2 Background

Cox’s Bazar is among the poorest districts of Bangladesh. The sub-districts (“Upazilas”) Ukhia and Teknaf under Cox’s Bazar are among the 50 most socially deprived upazilas. Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (WaSH) is one of the significant concerns in communities in Cox’s Bazar where access to clean drinking water and improved sanitation is below national average. The recent influx of Rohingya refugees is further exacerbating the situation and host communities are concerned about the rapid depletion of drinking water sources on the fringes of the refugee camps.

Sanitation in Teknaf and Ukhia is a major concern as coverage is low, with only around 30% of host communities having access to a sanitary latrine as compared to the national average of 61%. Hygiene practice is generally poor, and the risks of disease are increased by poor waste management and disposal of fecal sludge in open fields or water bodies.

The HYSAWA Fund (Hygiene, Sanitation and Water Supply Fund), was established in 2007 as a multi-donor funding mechanism and provides funds directly to the lowest level of sub-national government – the Union Parishads - for the delivery of proven sanitation and water supply facilities and hygiene promotion. This decentralized approach is adopted to empower the Local Government Institutions (LGIs) to plan, implement and manage public water and sanitation at the local level. The commitment to strengthening locally managed processes is in line with the Constitution of Bangladesh, it is an explicit political commitment of the current government and it is supported by the legal framework surrounding the functioning of the Local Government Institutions.

HYSAWA, supported by the Government of Bangladesh, Germany, Australia and Denmark is managed as a not-for-profit company and governed by a board headed by the Secretary of the Local Government Division of the Government of Bangladesh.

Since, December 2018, SDC and DANIDA have earmarked funds that support the affected refugee hosting communities of Cox’s Bazar, through HYSAWA, to implement a project to help the host community and Rohingya refugee in meeting their needs in the area of safe drinking water, sanitation and hygiene. The goal of the Project is to **improve the health conditions of**

vulnerable host communities and Rohingya refugees through empowering LGIs in addressing Water, Sanitation and Hygiene problems in Cox's Bazar.

The Project helps LGIs to develop annual plans and budgets by involving local people to tackle the impact of the influx of Rohingya refugees on the lives of local citizens in Cox's Bazar. Targets of the Project are to provide access to safe drinking water for 89,000 host community people; to support 30,000 Rohingya through installing more than 2000 new water points; and, to help 24,000 host community people and more than 1,500 Rohingya in installing latrines. It is also expected that 50,000 people will be reached with information on hygiene. The Project's outcomes are defined as:

Outcome 1: Local Government Institutions are empowered to provide more people-oriented public services, in particular water supply, sanitation services and hygiene promotion.

Outcome 2: Targeted men, women, boys and girls in Rohingya camps and host communities enjoy effective, sufficient and continuous water, sanitation services and hygiene promotion.

The Projects total budget is **BDT 720 million**

- Embassy of Switzerland: BDT 211 million (CHF 2.485 million)
- Embassy of Denmark: BDT 468 million (DKK 36 million)
- Community contribution: BDT 42 million

The support is planned to conclude by the end of 2021. SDC and Danida therefore decided to undertake a mid-term review (MTR) to assess the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, sustainability, management arrangements and success of the Project, including signs of potential impact on people's health condition, and; on local government institutions and beneficiaries and sustainability of results, including the contribution to capacity development. The MTR should also identify lessons learned and make recommendations for HYSAWA to improve the design and implementation of projects and programs in future.

The Project has not yet been operational in the Rohingya Refugee Camp and the MTR has therefore assessed this issue a separate section under relevance (see section 2.2).

1.3 Methodology and approach

As a consequence of the Covid-19 pandemic, the assignment was carried out through virtual meetings via Zoom and Skype in addition to a short visit to Cox's Bazar for face-to-face meetings with beneficiaries and project staff at the local level. Meetings were set up by SDC and HYSAWA and facilitated by the MTR team.

During the visit to Cox's Bazar the national consultant met with HYSAWA project manager, Additional Director of RRR; Executive Engineer of DPHE, Representatives of SDC, Chairman of Holdiapang UP, and Mayor of Teknaf Pourashava. In addition, focus group discussions were conducted with peoples' representatives of Zaliapalong UP, WASH Sector NGOs and two groups of water point beneficiaries of Zaliapalong UP.

Virtual meetings were held with SDC and Danida staff; LGD Additional Secretary, HYSAWA managing director and with HYSAWA staff, UNICEF, UNHCR, ACF, and; the SDC WaSH Technical Support Unit in Cox's Bazar. All meetings were facilitated by the MTR team.

Meetings were carried out applying semi-structured interviews with an approach that was clarifying, strategic, circular (open), and reflective, prepared in advance with a specific purpose. Starting point for the discussions were based on the OECD-DAC evaluation criteria applied to the Project. See Annex 2.

The MTR had several meetings with HYSAWA to collect relevant information, be informed on challenges and implementation issues relevant for the MTR and to understand the HYSAWA project management set-up.

Meetings with Government officials were factual to understand national and local strategies and to understand the national and local situation on WaSH. At the local level meetings with Upazila chairmen included understanding of program ownership and relevance.

The field visit to beneficiaries in Cox's Bazar were carried out by the national consultant on the team. The field visit schedule did not allow time to visit the Rohingya Refugee Camps.

For the pending program implementation in the Rohingya refugee camps, the focus was to understand the underlying causes for delay, mapping the demand thus far and drawing conclusions and recommendations for the way forward.

2 Relevance and Coherence

2.1 Relevance overall

HYSAWAs support to Cox's Bazar continues to be relevant. Especially in host communities, where HYSAWA is one of few organizations with substantial funding.

The Project contributes to achieving the GoB's target of improved sanitation for 90% of people in rural areas and access to safe water for all by 2021, as set out in the 7th Five Year Plan of the GoB. Currently, only 78% of people in Teknaf have access to safe drinking water sources, and only around 30% of host communities have access to a sanitary latrine.

The Project is well in line with the overall Bangladesh strategy for WaSH: *Safe and sustainable water supply, sanitation and hygiene services for all, leading to better health and well-being* by specifically supporting *Increasing the coverage and improving the quality of WaSH interventions* – one of three legs in the national WaSH strategy.

The Project targets SDG-3 (good health and well-being), especially *Mortality rate attributed to unsafe water, unsafe sanitation and lack of hygiene*, where the needs prevail, and the 2020 SDG

progress report for Bangladesh¹ concludes that more attention is needed to WaSH. The Project directly targets SDG-6 (clean water and sanitation) and contributes to the target of 84.6% of household members now using improved sanitation facilities, up from 61% in 2015. The SDG 2020 progress report confirms that: *It is an extremely difficult situation to arrange safe drinking water and proper sanitation in Teknaf (a geographically challenging area), and more support is needed.*

The Project targets SDG-16 (peace, justice and strong institutions). Relevance of this is clear from the SDG 2020 progress report where only *39.69 per cent of the population* (edit. nationwide) *are satisfied with their last experience of public services.*

The Project is aligned to SDC priorities of *addressing local administrative reform and civic participation* and relevant for LGIs to provide more transparent and people-oriented public services which is an innovation at the local level.

The Project is also aligned to SDC and Danida priorities on *gender equality and access to water* by targeting men, women, boys and girls in host communities to enjoy effective, sufficient and continuous water, sanitation services and hygiene promotion.

2.2 Relevance of support to Rohingya Camps

WaSH support to Rohingya refugee camps is densely packed with agencies supporting WaSH inside the camps. This leaves no direct room for HYSAWAs approach to WaSH. It should be underlined, of course, that the MTR team did not visit the camps because of Covid-19 and findings are therefore based on meetings with stakeholders who were aware of the situation in the camps.

There are 28 separate entities that are working on WaSH in the Rohingya refugee camps and the total funding available through these is substantial. This was confirmed by the Executive Engineer of DPHE and Additional Relief, Refugee and Repatriation Coordinator. The Executive Engineer of DPHE mentioned that *"there is hardly any scope for the Project to work on WaSH sector at the camps due to overcrowding of projects. However, maintenance works could be continued at the camps"*². The Additional Refugee Relief and Repatriation Commissioner added that *"Too many projects are being implemented at the camps. Therefore, new installations are not required. Rather, we would welcome the Project to work on giant water treatment plans at camp no 21, 22, 24, 25 26 and 27 in Tena areas as the people of these places suffer acutely from water crises during winter. Moreover, the Project could work jointly with other projects, if they fall short of money"*³.

The global humanitarian organization ACF (Action Against Hunger) reported that they would welcome HYSAWA's financial support inside the camps, and commended HYSAWA's work

¹ https://www.bd.undp.org/content/bangladesh/en/home/library/democratic_governance/bangladesh-sustainable-development-goals--sdgs--progress-report-.html

² KII, 06/10/2020.

³ KII, 06/10/2020.

with the local government both as implementer and in capacity development. But they also acknowledged that HYSAWA “classic” approach, an approach which is driven by social mapping and participatory planning processes in hard-to-reach areas, leading to implementation of selected small-scale water points and sanitation facilities, would presently work better in the host communities.

WaSH service provision inside the camps is focused on larger schemes, including piped water and water treatment plants. Such projects are suited to densely populated areas and are usually associated with urban development. The approach is still emergency response and highly supply led. This is much different from HYSAWA’s “classic” approach, well suited for rural development in hard-to-reach areas with conditions similar to that in host communities, but not well suited for work in refugee camps.

According to several organizations working on WaSH inside the camps, they contribute much less to the host communities than was originally planned. Their contribution to host communities was anticipated to account for 25% of the total support provided. According to ACF and others do the substantial support to host communities from HYSAWA makes up for some of this and has reduced tension between the host communities and the Rohingyas.

2.3 Coherence

The Project has strong alignment with the SDC’s goal of providing better WaSH services to the poor community in host communities. But HYSAWA as an organization, is little known to and not coordinated with the SDC supported WaSH Technical Resource Unit office under DHPE in Cox’s Bazar. However, there seem to be opportunities for cooperation that could benefit both projects, where HYSAWA could share local knowledge and where the SDC supported Technical Resource Unit could assist by filling in technical gaps.

The Project has strong synergies with the activities of other actors working in the WaSH sector in Cox’s Bazar area and its strength in facilitating public participating and developing capacity in LGIs is of value to all actors in the sector.

HYSAWA participates, with a local representative, in donor coordination meetings of WaSH activities in Cox’s Bazar but seems to be working in isolation and is apparently little known by most other NGO and other organizations working with WaSH in the Cox’s Bazar.

DPHE, the nodal department responsible to provide WASH services at the local level, seem to have limited coordination with the Project. The Executive Engineer of the DPHE said: *"we are not quite aware of the activities that are being implemented by HYSAWA. We have sent them a letter instructing them to inform us about their activities. But I understand that they have sent their reply"*.⁴ The Project does, however, try to ensure that there is no overlap with local DPHE and NGO activities on WaSH.

The Project works jointly with the SDC-DANIDA funded UNDP Efficient and Accountable Local Government Project (EALG) project to organize meetings of ward shova (WS) and open

⁴ KII, 06/10/2020

budget meetings ensuring the participation of the community people to make sure that the citizens could identify their needs. This was done in relation to ensure pro-poor planning and budgeting at the local level.

3 Performance

3.1 Effectiveness

The Project is on or ahead of target to deliver the determined outputs and outcomes.

At outcome level targets have been met except for achieving satisfactory levels of public satisfaction with LGIs in delivering water and sanitation services. By December 2019 a satisfaction level of 28% was achieved, up from a baseline of 25% but clearly short of the 50% target. Paying more specific attention on work with capacity development of LGIs in participatory planning and budgeting to deliver WaSH services may facilitate achieving this target.

| Narrative Summary | Verifiable Indicators | Baseline (May 2019) | Achievement (Dec 2019) | Target (2020) |
|--|---|---------------------|------------------------|---------------|
| Outcome 1: Local Government Institutions are empowered to provide more people-oriented public services, in particular water supply, sanitation services and hygiene promotion. | % of target group satisfied with public service delivery in general | 58% | 84% | 78% |
| | % of target group in LGIs satisfied with water supply, sanitation and hygiene related public services | 25% | 28% | 50% |
| Outcome 2: Targeted men, women, boys and girls in Rohingya camps and host communities have improved health conditions from access to effective, sufficient and continuous water, sanitation services and hygiene promotion. | Annual decrease in number of children < 36 months served in the last two months with acute diarrhea/ total children in community, disaggregated by targeted Rohingyas and host communities. | 20% | 12% | 10% |

Ledger:

x – exceeds target

y – on target

z – below target, at risk of not being achieved.

As can be seen from the table above, the general perception on public service delivery has exceeded its target of 78%, by being at 84% from a baseline of 58%. The decrease in children with acute diarrhea is on target by 12% down from 20% with an end of project target of 10%.

⁵ Does not include reduction gained in the Rohingya camps that is achieved through other organizations.

At output level targets are being met or exceeded. However, there is a need to better address women's participation in the Project. Gender disaggregation indicates that the ratio of women involved in the planning processes is 1:5 where a 1:1 gender balance was expected.

The requirement for a self-contribution of 10% to project installation cost for individuals to receive a private latrine is useful and generates commitment to the proper use and maintenance of the facilities provided. However, as a result of this requirement, the extreme poor and disadvantaged segment of the population have limited or no access to individual project support. Review of the social mapping of Rumkha Palong village identified 3 disadvantaged families that needed improved latrines. But the Project could not provide them with the improved latrines as they were unable to provide 10% self-contribution. The Project officials stated that *"10% contribution is one of the preconditions to be eligible for receiving our services. Since they could not contribute, we could not provide them an improved sanitary latrine. However, we are trying to convince the community people to raise funds for them so that they could get the support"*⁶. HYSAWA is considering how to provide services to the extreme poor and disadvantaged families free of charge, based on contributing funds from the community. A strategy for the Project to deal with this is currently absent and should be in place. Calculating in-kind contribution is a common solution to this.

Taknaf and Ukhia Upazilas now have capacity developed to deal with tender related activities in a more transparent process but have yet to consolidate their acquired capacity. Peoples representatives have felt empowered as they are now providing WaSH services to their constituencies with the support of HYSAWA. UP representatives are gaining confidence and start to feel empowered as they have spent larger budgets received from HYSAWA as compared to government allocation. The UP representative express that they are happy to now being able to provide better services to their constituency. The Chairman of Holdiapalong UP expressed that *"it gives us an immense happiness as we could help the poor community people by providing deep set tube-wells and improved sanitary latrines"*⁷. This was confirmed by people interviewed in the community. While commenting on this one FGD participants mentioned that *"previously when we used to meet the people's representatives for these services, they could not even listen to us with patience. Now, they not only listen to us but also try to help us when we are in need"*⁸.

The Project has focused its capacity development activities on the UP secretary. It may have been more effective to explore the mechanisms for public participation and particularly to see whether it had been more effective to involve Ward and Union WATSAN committee responsible for overseeing the WaSH related activities in the UP. Focusing capacity development on these committees could lead to attaining more sustainability of the services as these people, once trained, may remain engaged in overseeing the WaSH related activities at community level after the Project.

⁶ Interview with the Project Manager and Community Organizer, 06/10/2020

⁷ FGD with UP representatives, 05/10/2020

⁸ FGD with the citizens, 06/10/2020

People experience that their living conditions are improved in relation to access to safe drinking water and sanitary latrines. *“Previously we had to travel several kilometers to bring drinking water. Now we can get clean drinking water from the deep tube-well”*⁹.

The incidence of water-borne diseases has decreased in the community, particularly among children, and this has led to a reduction in expenditure on health services and medication. Before *“we had to spend money to buy medicines and pay fee to the doctors for our disease. Now, we can use the money for the education of our children”*.¹⁰

From the field visit it has become clear, however, that the Project should do more to engage target communities in the identification of beneficiaries and strengthening the various governance structures that oversee WaSH service at the UP level. This could include establishing standing committees and WATSAN committees at UP level and a WATSAN committee at union level.

It should be noted that the Project rapidly adapted to the Covid-19 situation and has been instrumental in influencing communities to practice safer sanitation and frequent hand washing during the Covid-19 through dissemination of information through posters, billboards and house to house motivation.

3.2 Efficiency

The Project delivers cost effective outputs and outcomes compared to other organizations working in the same area and delivers the results in a timely manner and ahead of budget. Covid-19 has, however, delayed delivery and especially capacity development of LGIs. Project management is efficient with transparent monitoring and a highly profiled board of directors.

Compared to other organizations delivering similar kinds of WaSH services, the Project delivers water wells between 6% and 34 % more cost efficiently and school and public sanitation almost 50% more cost efficiently, see table below.

| USD per unit installed ¹¹ | HYSAWA | NGOF | DSK | ACF | DPHE |
|---|---------------|-------------|------------|------------|-------------|
| Deep Tube Well (DTW)¹² | 1,511 | 2,382 | 1,806 | 2,150 | 1,602 |
| School Latrine/ public latrine | 5,375 | 10,339 | - | - | 9,020 |
| Source: HYSAWA based on various contractors and organizations NGOF: NGO Forum for Public Health; DSK: Dushtha Shasthya Kendra (Center of health for poor citizens), ACF: Action contre la Faim-France, DPHE: Department of Public Health Engineering | | | | | |

The Project is likely to achieve targets before the end of the project period. HYSAWA projects that, with regard to the host communities, all project deliverables will be provided according to or ahead of plans. All output targets were already achieved or on-target by December 2019:

⁹ FGD with the citizens, 06/10/2020

¹⁰ FGD with the citizens, 06/10/2020

¹¹ Exchange rate USD1=BDT 84.8

¹² Depth approx. 250 meter

Outputs under Outcome1:

- All supported LGIs regularly disclose public information on budget and expenditure
- All UPs involve the public in their planning and budgeting through Ward Shova meetings
- Almost 80% of beneficiaries are satisfied with the services provided by LGIs. Significant improvement from the baseline of 42% satisfaction

Outputs under Outcome 2:

- 53% have access to adequate supply of safe drinking water (on-target) – target 59%
- 55% have access to functional and hygienic latrines – target 34%
- 364 sanitation facilities are constructed – target 360
- 43% of households are using soap and water in a handwashing facility – target 33%
- 25% of women and girls dispose of their menstrual pads – target 36%

That targets are achieved ahead of schedule may be explained by the fact that the Project has had no activities in the Rohingya camps. It may also suggest that level of ambitions on project targets could be increased for targets related to construction of WaSH facilities, if budget reallocations could be made available.

The Project has been successful in getting the LGI representatives involved in direct service delivery. LGI representatives prepares the list of priorities based on the list of needs for services identified through social mapping. LGI representatives also supervise the whole process of installation of tube-wells and construction of improved latrines.

4 Impact

WaSH interventions can have many effects directly and indirectly on the health, wellbeing and life chances of beneficiary communities. There is already evidence that the Project generates local impacts and contributes to “higher-level effects”¹³ addressing the needs and the gaps of WaSH in vulnerable host communities. Most importantly has the support has contributed to a significant reduction in diarrhea cases – in targeted communities the cases have been reduced by as much as 50%.

Support has delivered significant impact in host communities– see table.

| | May 2019 (baseline) | February 2020 |
|---|--------------------------------|----------------------|
| Safe water coverage (within 50 m distance) | 47% | 53% |
| Sanitation coverage (Access to own safe toilet) | 17% | 55% |
| Hygiene coverage (wash hand in critical times) | 8% | 43% |
| Any children below 36 month suffered Diarrhea in last two months | 20% | 12% |

¹³ Terminology in the SDC assessment grid – see Annex 1

Source: HYSAWA

In addition, open defecation has been reduced significantly from 3% to 1% and has had major impact on the local environment condition with reduced pollution of local streams and water canals.

Peoples satisfaction on LGI WaSH services increased from 42% in 2019 (baseline) to 79%, with women slightly more satisfied with LGI services than men.

Capacity development activities in LGIs have generated enthusiasm and LGIs have started to work with more transparent planning and procedures. LGIs can now take a lead role in planning, budgeting, implementing and monitoring WaSH services in the intervention areas. The LGIs now develop budgets and annual plans as per the GoB requirement and disburse funds accordingly for construction of WaSH services and disclose public information on budget and actual expenditure on a regular basis.

Standing Committees on WaSH have been activated and instigated more appropriate governance in the UPs, however, Union WATSAN Committees and Ward WATSAN committees, although part of the local governance structure, were not included in the Project implementation. Standing Committees can only have impact if the actors involved in it are well-informed about processes, options, and the opportunities and constraints under which they operate. This requires training for the members and the chair.

The Project has missed an opportunity by not using these structures to involve members of the community in Ward and Union WATSAN decision making. Training of Standing Committee members could also impact civic education in WaSH services as well as contributing to the more effective oversight of the maintenance of tube-wells and sanitary latrines.

GPS tracking and mapping, through which all people with internet access can access essential information of all project installed WaSH facilities, have contributed to more open and transparent governance of WaSH in Cox's Bazar. The transparency will be increased even more, if all Government and other organizations' WaSH interventions were to be made available, including installation costs.

Impact on WaSH in Rohingya camps cannot be attributed to the HYSAWA support, but it is reported that the Project's substantial support to the host communities has reduced the tension between the Rohingyas and people in host communities and alleviated discontent that host community people have felt where it was perceived that disproportionately generous support has been provided to the Rohingya camps.

5 Sustainability

Sustainability of the Project could be improved. LGIs have engaged enthusiastically with the Project and devoted staff has closely with project personnel but the capacity is still to be consolidated as staff has not yet been able to repeatedly apply and demonstrate their acquired

skills. It is unlikely that the developed capacity will be sustained without further support and more time for LGs in practice to demonstrate their ability to plan, budget, and involve public consultation in decision making.

The self-contribution of 10% shows commitment and indicates willingness to use and maintain the installed WaSH facilities will continue to need support for the foreseeable future.

WaSH implementation in Cox's Bazar will for a long time continue to require external support. LGs do not, after project completion, have sufficient funding or internal income to continue the high level of WaSH provided through the Project. In addition, the community members would find it difficult to identify the funds needed for these investments.

No indications suggest that Government funds to WaSH will reach the magnitude of HYSAWA support in near future. Internal revenue collection of the UP's in Bangladesh is low and the majority of UP's in the country suffer from inadequate resources. The Annual development programs and LGSP-III seem inadequate compared to the demands and needs of the community and cannot match the funds supported from HYSAWA. An LG representative stated that *"we always suffer from insufficient funds to deal with growing demands of the people because the central government grants are scanty. Moreover, we could not earn much money from our internal sources. Therefore, the amount of support which has been given by HYSAWA is quite handsome as compared to government grants. Through this amount we have provided support to many poor community people. However, our demands are unlimited. Therefore, HYSAWA should increase their supports so that we could help more people."*¹⁴

Support from HYSAWA to Cox's Bazar will always rely on funds from external sources; either international support or government support and the Project is at risk of not being able to sustain the progress achieved beyond the implementation period. HYSAWA is, jointly with LGD, working on the possibility to get budget code that will allow projects to be awarded from the Government of Bangladesh and access to funds from e.g., ADB, World Bank and JICA.

The Maintenance Fund for WaSH established by HYSAWA nationwide for facilities installed by HYSAWA, has a capital of BDT 20 million, to which all facility owners, including those in Cox's Bazar, contribute and can apply for funds for maintenance. Currently HYSAWA anticipates that the fund could last for at least 5 years, if not replenished. The Maintenance Fund is not widely known to WaSH beneficiaries in the Project area. Hence, the risk is that installed WaSH facilities will not receive the required maintenance and go out of service or deteriorate long before anticipated. A strategy beyond the Maintenance Fund to ensure long-term maintenance of the installed facilities is absent and needs to be developed.

A sustainability plan and exit strategy for the support in Cox's Bazar is not available and would substantially guide the scope and ambition of the current and upcoming support.

¹⁴ FGD with the LG Representatives of Holdiapalong UP, 05/10/2020

6 Management Arrangements

6.1 HYSAWA Management and monitoring

The Project is well managed and HYSAWA's management arrangement is appropriate and well-functioning to implement what is largely "HYSAWA classic", i.e., similar to WaSH projects. HYSAWA has been supporting and implementing for many years in other hard-to-reach areas of Bangladesh.

Management of the Project is overseen both from HQ and from a local project office in Cox's Bazar. The project management is well-staffed both at HQ level, where the Managing Director spends a substantial part of his time overseeing the Project. Also, at local level the Project is well staffed with a Project Manager and a number of technical and community mobilization WaSH specialists to undertake project interventions in the host communities. To focus on gender aspects in project implementation a part-time gender focal point has recently been appointed and is dedicated to ensuring proper involvement of girls and women in planning and decision-making processes.

HYSAWA Project Management participate in WaSH coordination meetings with other agencies active in Cox's Bazar. According to interviewed organizations in Cox's Bazar it is reported as if project implementation happens in isolation in the host communities with limited cooperation with other partners in the area. Also, there are no records of attempt from HYSAWA Project Management to engage with the SDC supported WaSH Technical Resource Unit in Cox's Bazar. Their management is not aware of HYSAWA's support to WaSH. Stronger promotion of the Project's presence in Cox's Bazar and broader raising of awareness of the Project's achievements could draw attention from other organizations and development partners to support transparent WaSH processes at the local level in cooperation with HYSAWA.

Appropriate project monitoring procedures are in place and baselines established. Monitoring is transparent and timely and in addition to HYSAWA staff's monitoring of progress the Project has developed and applied a GPS based monitoring system that includes basic information on location of all installed WaSH facilities. To enhance transparency the GPS information should include construction costs of the WaSH facilities.

6.2 HYSAWA's Governing Board

HYSAWA's Governing Board oversees the implementation of the Project and is chaired by Chairman the Senior Secretary of Local Government Division, Ministry of Local Government Rural Development & Co-Operatives. It also includes representatives from Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Health, Local Government Institutions and Development Partners.

The Governing Board meets at regular intervals and at least twice per year. Major decisions are made by the Governing Board and recorded in minutes of meetings.

6.3 Budget Analysis and Financial Management

HYSAWA keeps appropriate record of accounts. A recent financial audit identified several minor issues. HYSAWA has prepared a detailed response to auditor's remarks.

By 30 September 2020 the Project expenditures were 40% of the total planned budget, while approx. 54% of the Project implementation time had elapsed. Expenditure on Outcome 1 was, as anticipated, 53% of budget. Expenditure on Outcome 2 was at 39% of budget and much less than the planned. This is explained in part by contractors only being paid once the WaSH facilities are fully constructed and approved by HYSAWA staff.

7 Lessons learned

Many lessons are similar to the Mid-term review carried out in September 2019¹⁵ on other SDC support to HYSAWA: ***Empowering and Decentralizing Local Government Institutions to manage Hygiene, Sanitation and Water Supply Service Delivery in hard-to-reach Areas of Bangladesh.***

The following lessons, however, are drawn from this MTR:

Decentralized WaSH implemented through LGIs enhance local governance and ownership

LGI representatives have developed confidence and empowerment through capacity development and by the project allowing them to take responsibility for planning and in managing an amount of funds for WaSH that is considerably larger than they are used to handling. The LG representatives feel empowered and have greater job satisfaction when approving the list of beneficiaries with the assistance of the community members. The LG representatives' confidence has greatly increased as they now make decisions through open tender, assess the bids and award the tender to the best bidder. This capacity will help them to apply such responsibilities in the future. Their concern is that they are not required to practice open tendering for the implementation of all development activities.

Self-contribution to WaSH installations contributes to sustainability but excludes the extreme poor and disadvantaged.

The required 10% matching funds to any WaSH installation works well and develops strong ownership among the parties that can afford paying the matching fund. The automatic demand for self-contribution, however, poses a dilemma in response to needs of extreme poor and disadvantaged people that cannot afford paying the self-contribution of 10% of installation costs. This calls for a strategy where there is a high level of in-kind contribution from the extreme poor in terms of labor or that the local community accepts to provide an additional contribution to ensure that also extreme poor and disadvantaged people can get access to individual WaSH services, without jeopardizing self-contribution from people that can afford paying the matching funds.

GPS tracking and web-based information of WaSH installations promote transparency

¹⁵ Midterm Review of Empowering and Decentralizing Local Government Institutions to manage Hygiene, Sanitation and Water Supply Service Delivery in hard-to-reach Areas of Bangladesh HYSAWA-SDC Project, 2nd phase. Commissioned by SDC Bangladesh, September 2019

The Project developed a GPS tracking system of the WaSH installations it established that included information on location, ownership, etc. This is an efficient way of providing information on how and where LGI funds (in this case channeled through HYSAWA) are used. This promotes more open and transparent governance and is easy to get to for anyone with internet access. This system could be used for LGIs' decisions and support even more transparency by adding in costs of each installed facility and expand the tracking to all other WaSH installations supported by the government and other organizations.

8 Conclusion and recommendations

8.1 Conclusion

The overall conclusion of the Mid-Term Review is that the Project ***WaSH Support for Rohingya Refugees and Vulnerable Local Communities in Cox's Bazar District*** implemented through HYSAWA is performing satisfactory to highly satisfactory with concerns on sustainability of the interventions.

The Project is well managed and HYSAWAs management arrangement is appropriate and well-functioning to implement what is largely "HYSAWA classic".

The support to Cox's Bazar continues to be relevant in host communities, where HYSAWA is one of few organizations with substantial funding, applying an approach that contributes to the GoB targets on WaSH. The Project is aligned to SDC priorities addressing local administration reforms, gender equality and access to water. Relevance to climate change is limited.

The project approach is not relevant for Rohingya refugee camps that are already receiving support to WaSH from a range of organizations. Seen in this context HYSAWA should focus all its efforts on the host communities and be relieved from its obligation to work inside the Rohingya camps.

The Project has strong coherence with the SDC's focus on providing better WaSH services to the poor community in host communities. The Project works jointly with Efficient and Accountable Local Government Project (EALG) to organize local meetings. Coordination with SDCs support to the WaSH Technical Resource Unit in Cox's Bazar could be improved.

The Project performs well and is effective in implementation, it will achieve its targeted results and already contributes to the objectives of ***improving the health conditions of vulnerable host communities through empowering LGIs in addressing Water, Sanitation and Hygiene problems in Cox's Bazar.***

The self-contribution of 10% to project implementation for individual is healthy and generate ownership of water and sanitation facilities, but the self-contribution excludes the extremely poor and disadvantaged and an alternative strategy to include this group of people is needed.

UP representatives are gaining confidence and start to feel empowered and LGIs are motivated. Capacity still need to be consolidated and onward more focus on capacity development of WATSAN committees is needed to attain more sustainability.

Local impact generated by the Project is high and has contributed to a significant reduction in diarrhea cases – in targeted communities the cases have been reduced by as much as 50%.

The projects sustainability is at risk and the Project is pressed for time to sustain results already gained. Especially on capacity development with LGIs where capacity need to be consolidated and routines developed. This is unlikely to happen without further support and more time for LGIs in practice to demonstrate their ability to plan, budget, and involve public consultation in decision making.

Also, WaSH installed facilities in host communities will for a long time continue to require external support both for maintenance and procedures need to be put in place to ensure this.

8.2 Recommendations

Based on the findings of the MTR, the team recommends the following:

1. SDC approves a no-cost extension of project implementation by one year to appropriately sustain developed capacity with both LGIs and with local communities and to ensure appropriate exit of the Project.
2. SDC and Danida recognize and acknowledge that other organizations are better placed to deliver WaSH support in the conditions currently prevailing in Rohingya camps and therefore adjust Outcome 2 to read: *Targeted men, women, boys and girls in host communities enjoy effective, sufficient and continuous water, sanitation services and hygiene promotion.*
3. HYSAWA prepares, urgently, a specific strategy for exit of HYSAWA in Cox's Bazar with focus on:
 - a. enhancing and sustaining already achieved capacity developed with LGIs to ensure that they are capable in undertaking transparent procedures and participatory approaches for future WaSH installations, which could include repetition of training and hands-on supervision
 - b. meeting current targets of water and sanitation installations
 - c. facilitating, where possible, a higher rate of women's involvement in planning and decision making
 - d. developing and implementing a strategy/policy to ensure that WaSH services can be made available also for extreme poor and disadvantaged families without a 10% self-contribution, e.g., applying in-kind contribution
 - e. enhance raising the awareness of the HYSAWA Maintenance Fund for project recipients in Cox's Bazar.
 - f. facilitating enhanced transparency of WaSH in Cox's Bazar, e.g., through the WaSH coordination group in Cox's Bazar, by advocating for an expansion of the

GPS tracking system to include all national and international supported WaSH installations in Cox's Bazar

- g. reallocating budget between outcome 2 and outcome 1 to still achieve output targets and make a no-cost extension of the Project for approx. 1 year possible and focus this year on enhanced capacity development, especially of LGIs.
4. HYSAWA establishes linkages with DPHE's WaSH work including clear linkages with the SDC WaSH project in Cox's Bazar.

Annexes

Annex 1: SDC Assessment Grid for the DAC Criteria

Tool 7: Assessment Grid for the DAC Criteria

Assessment Grid for project/programme evaluations of the SDC interventions

Version: 30.06.2020

Note: this assessment grid is used for evaluations of SDC financed projects and programmes (hereinafter jointly referred to as an 'intervention'). It is based on the OECD Development Assistance Committee evaluation criteria.¹⁶ In mid-term evaluations, the assessment requires analysing the likelihood of achieving impact and sustainability. All applicable sub-criteria should be scored and a short explanation should be provided.

Please add the corresponding number (0-4) representing your rating of the sub-criteria in the column 'score':

0 = not assessed

1 = highly satisfactory

2 = satisfactory

3 = unsatisfactory

4 = highly unsatisfactory

| Key aspects based on DAC Criteria | Score (put only integers: 0, 1, 2, 3 or 4) | Justification (please provide a short explanation for your score or why a criterion was not assessed) |
|--|--|---|
| Relevance Note: the assessment here captures the relevance of objectives and design <i>at the time of evaluation</i> . In the evaluation report, both relevance at the design stage as well as relevance at the time of evaluation should be discussed. | | |
| 1. The extent to which the objectives of the intervention respond to the needs and priorities of the target group. | 1 | The project objectives are in lines with the priority of the Government of Bangladesh in relation to WaSH at the intervention areas. Moreover, the project has clearly helped the government to attain SDG-3, 6 & 16. WaSH continues to be important in an area where |

¹⁶ For information on the 2019 revisions of the evaluation framework see: Better Criteria for Better Evaluations. Revised Evaluation Criteria. Definitions and Principles for Use, OECD/DAC Network on Development Evaluation, 2019.

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| | | people have less access to water supply and sanitation services – in some areas less than 54% have access. |
| 2. The extent to which the objectives of the intervention respond to the needs and priorities of indirectly affected stakeholders (not included in target group, e.g. government, civil society, etc.) in the country of the intervention. | 2 | The project generally benefits all affected stakeholders, but a challenge is to reach the extremely poor and disadvantaged people. |
| 3. The extent to which core design elements of the intervention (such as the theory of change, structure of the project components, choice of services and intervention partners) adequately reflect the needs and priorities of the target group. | 1 | The objective is relevant, and the outcomes and outputs are designed to reflect the needs and priorities of the target group |
| Coherence | | |
| 4. Internal coherence: the extent to which the intervention is compatible with other interventions of Swiss development cooperation in the same country and thematic field (consistency, complementarity and synergies). | 1 | The project has strong coherence with the SDC's focus on providing better WaSH services to the poor community at host and Refugee camps. |
| 5. External coherence: the extent to which the intervention is compatible with interventions of other actors in the country and thematic field (complementarity and synergies). | 1 | The project has strong synergies with the priority of other actors working in WaSH sector in Cox's Bazar area. |
| Effectiveness | | |
| 6. The extent to which approaches/strategies during implementation are adequate to achieve the intended results. | 2 | The approach and strategy are adequate for project implementation and self-contribution of 10% to project implementation for individuals is healthy and generate ownership. This, however, exclude to a large extent the extremely poor and disadvantaged as they cannot provide the required self-contribution. The project could improve engaging community people in the identification of beneficiaries and strengthening different governance structures that are responsible for WaSH service at the UP level. |
| 7. The extent to which the intervention achieved or is expected to achieve its intended objectives (outputs and outcomes). | 1 | The project is on targets or ahead of targets at output and outcome level and are expected to exceed targets at the end of the project |
| 8. The extent to which the intervention achieved or is expected to achieve its intended results related to transversal themes. | 2 | The project is expected to reduce incidents of children's diarrhea; increase democratization but has difficulties in achieving gender balance in planning and budgeting processes where the ration of women to men's participation is 1:5 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| Efficiency | | |
| 9. The extent to which the intervention delivers the results (outputs, outcomes) cost-effectively. | 1 | The project delivers cost effective outputs and outcomes compared to other organizations working in the same area. |
| 10. The extent to which the intervention delivers the results (outputs, outcome) in a timely manner (within the intended timeframe or reasonably adjusted timeframe). | 1 | The project delivers the results in a timely manner and ahead of budget schedule. Covid-19 has delayed delivery and especially capacity development of LGIs. |
| 11. The extent to which management, monitoring and steering mechanisms support efficient implementation. | 1 | Management of the project is overseen both from HQ and from a local project office; monitoring is transparent and timely applying a GPS based monitoring system and steering committee is committed with a highly profiled chairman |
| Impact | | |
| 12. The extent to which the intervention generated or is expected to generate 'higher-level effects' as defined in the design document of the intervention. Note: when assessing this criterion, the primary focus is the intended 'higher-level effects'. In the event that <i>significant</i> unintended negative or positive effects can be discerned, they must be specified in the justification column, especially if they influence the score. | 1 | The project generates substantial local impacts and contribute to “higher-level effects” addressing the needs and the gaps of WaSH adapted to the climate context in vulnerable host communities |
| Sustainability | | |
| 13. The extent to which partners are capable and motivated (technical capacity, ownership) to continue activities contributing to achieving the outcomes. | 2 | LGIs seems motivated and have received capacity development, but the capacity is not consolidated as staff has not yet been able to repeatedly apply and demonstrate their capacity |
| 14. The extent to which partners have the financial resources to continue activities contributing to achieving the outcomes. | 3 | The self-contribution of 10% generate ownership and leads to achieving outputs, but LGIs do now have sufficient funding and internal incomes to continue the high level of providing WaSH after project completion and hence, will not be able to further achieve the outcomes. In addition, the community people would find it difficult to invest the needed money required, let alone finding money for maintenance. |
| 15. The extent to which contextual factors (e.g. legislation, politics, economic situation, social demands) is conducive to continuing activities leading to outcomes. | 1 | The project will have no or limited resistance from the government or community to implement their activities that would lead them to attain outcomes as there is the existence of a conducive environment for the implementation of the project |

Additional information (if needed): Part of the assessment was carried out with virtual meetings and field visit was carried out in a reduced form, as a consequence of Covid-19

Title of the intervention: WaSH Support for Rohingya Refugees and Vulnerable Local Communities in Cox's Bazar District.

Assessor(s): Lars Mikkell Johannessen, Independent International Consultant and Pranab Kumar Panday, Independent National Consultant

Date: 3. November, 2020

Annex 2: Application of the OECD DAC criteria to the MTR

| Review objectives | Application to the Mid-term Review |
|--------------------------|--|
| Relevance | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Alignment of program objectives with policy directions of Bangladesh in water, sanitation and hygiene and how the project reflects the priorities of HYSAWA, the SDC and Danida in terms of sectors and country focus as well as cross-cutting themes. • Implementation strategy and approach reflecting the needs of beneficiaries and stakeholders, including beneficiary Local Government Division |
| Coherence | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extent of compatibility of interventions with other SDC and Danida interventions in Bangladesh. • Extent to which this compatibility yields synergies in development results and impacts. |
| Effectiveness | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extent to which the approach to WaSH support to Cox's Bazar achieve the project objectives. • Extent to which the targeted outputs have been delivered so far and extent of contribution to expected immediate and intermediate outcomes, expressed as a change toward the targets of stipulated indicators in the log-frame |
| Efficiency | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extent to which the WaSH support to Cox's Bazar has demonstrated cost efficiency in terms of the transaction costs associated with the support relative to similar projects in Bangladesh • Extent to which the WaSH support to Cox's Bazar has demonstrated "cost-efficiency" in terms of the extent to which the project is implemented on-time and on-budget • Contribution of HYSAWA advise to LGI and support in promoting the efficient implementation and management of investments at the local level. |
| Impact | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The extent to which the targets are met for the decrease in number of children with acute diarrhea; equitable access to safe and affordable drinking water and access to adequate and equitable sanitation and hygiene, and; % of the population satisfied with water supply, sanitation and hygiene |
| Sustainability | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extent to which the positive results of the support will continue or are likely to continue beyond the end of the external support • Extent to which the program contributes to SDG 3 on health; SDG 6 on water and sanitation, and; SDG 16 on good governance. |

Annex 3: List of people met

| During Field Visit in Cox's Bazar | | |
|-----------------------------------|---|------------|
| Type | | Date |
| | Mr. Enamul Huq, Project Manager HYSAWA | 05/10/2020 |
| FGD | Zaliapalong Union Parishad, Ukhia Upazila | 05/10/2020 |
| FGD | WASH Sector NGO and Donor Partners ¹⁷ | 06/10/2020 |
| FGD | Beneficiaries (Water Point), Zaliapalong Upazila | 06/10/2020 |
| FGD | Beneficiaries (Water Point) Zaliapalong | 05/10/2020 |
| KII | Rafiqul Islam, SDC Representative working in Cox's Bazar | 05/10/2020 |
| KII | Holdiapalong UP Chairman | 06/10/2020 |
| KII | Rittik Chowdhury, Executive Engineer, DPHE | 06/10/2020 |
| KII | Md. Shamsuddhoa, Additional Relief, Refuge and Repatriation (RRR) Coordinator | 06/10/2020 |
| KII | Mohammad Islam, Mayor Tecknaf Pourashava (Over phone as was in Dhaka) | 06/10/2020 |
| Virtual Meetings | | |
| KII | Sudur Rahman Mollag, SDC | 13/10/2020 |
| KII | Bitalie Taskeen Islam, Head of Cooperation, DANIDA | 13/10/2020 |
| KII | Md. Nurul Osman, Acting Director, HYSAWA | 13/10/2020 |
| KII | Muhammad Ibrahim, Additional Secretary, LGD | 15/10/2020 |
| KII | Mohammad Monirul Islam, UNICEF | 15/10/2020 |
| KII | Minhaz Uddin Ahmed | 15/10/2020 |
| KII | Md. Nurul Osman, Acting Director, HYSAWA | 19/10/2020 |
| KII | Bland Ralph, SDC and Md. Rafiqul Islam, SDC | 19/10/2020 |
| KII | Md. Kowsar, ACF | 19/10/2020 |
| KII | Md. Nurul Osman, Acting Director, HYSAWA | 21/10/2020 |

¹⁷ The participants were: Project Manager, Nabolok; Program Officer-ActionAid; WASH Expert-BDRS BD Racecourse; Senior Partnership Manager-BD Racecourse; WASH Manager-IFRC; Program manager-BD Action Against Hunger; Deputy Field Coordinator- BD Action Against Hunger; Camp Focal Point (WASH)-NGO Forum; and Project Manager-VERC.

Annex 4: Selected Quotations from Focus Group Interviews

LG Representatives:

While expressing his feeling on a question relating to happiness of the LG representatives due to HYSAWA intervention the Chairman of Holdiapalong UP stated that *“it gives us an immense happiness as we could help the poor community people by providing deep set tube-wells and improved sanitary latrines”* (FGD with UP representatives, 05/10/2020).

While commenting the impact of HYSAWA fund the LG representatives stated that *“we always suffer from insufficient among funds to deal with growing demands of the people because the central government grants are scanty. Moreover, we could not earn much money from our internal sources. Therefore, the amount of support which has been given by HYSAWA is quite handsome as compared to government grants. Through this amount we have provided support to many poor community people. However, our demands are unlimited. Therefore, HYSAWA should increase their supports so that we could help more people (FGD with the LG Representatives of Holdiapalong UP, 05/10/2020).*

While commenting a question on whether they could be able to continue their activities, one LG representatives mentioned that *“it is true that HYSAWA has been providing us a quite substantial amount of money to install deep set tube-wells and improved latrines at the community. However, our demands are much higher than what is being given by HYSAWAY. Therefore, we would not be able to provide services to citizens once they would be phased out as the support of the government is very meagre”* (FGD with LG representatives of Holdiapalong, 5/10/2020).

Community people and service recipients:

While commenting on the improved living condition of the community people in relation to drinking pure water and using sanitary latrines one respondent of FGD session stated that *“Previously we had to travel to several kilo meters to bring drinking water. Even sometimes we were requited hike hills which created pressure on us. Now we can get pure drinking water from the deep tube-well”* (FGD with community, 06/10/2020).

Another community people motioned that *“now we could use this water to cultivate fruits and vegetables on our home yards which we could not do earlier as we do not have a tube-well (FGD, 06/10/2020).*

While commenting on the reduction of water borne disease One participant of FGD session mentioned that *“we had to spend money to buy medicines and pay fee to the doctors for our disease. Now, we can use the money for the education of our children”* (FGD, 06/10/2020).

Government officials:

While commenting on this the spending of funds in Rohingya camps the additional coordinator of RRR mentioned that *“frankly speaking we do not have any scope to welcome new construction in*

the most of the camps. But, we need maintenance works. However, we need water support for several camps (camp-21.22.23.25,26,27) at the Teknaf areas as there is an acute water crisis in Teknaf. Therefore, we welcome HYSAWA to invest in giant water treatment plan in this areas. If they fall short of funds we could tag the with other partners working in water supply (KII, 06/10/2020)".

While commenting on the coordination of HYSAWA, the executive engineer of DPHE mentioned that "*we are quite informed where HYSAWA is working and their working modality*" (KII, 06/10/2020).

Project Officials:

While commenting on a question on how they are addressing the issue of extremely poor and disadvantaged section of population who are failing to provide 10% contribution, the project official and the COs stated that "*10% contribution is one of the preconditions to be eligible for receiving our services Since they could not contribute we could not provide them an improved sanitary latrines. However, we are trying to convince the community people to raise funds for them so that they could get the support*" (Interview with the Project Manager and Community Organizer, 06/10/2020).