



OPERATIONAL AND FINANCIAL REPORT

**EXTERNAL EVALUATION: LESSONS LEARNED AND STRATEGY DEVELOPMENT PROCESS TO
REVIEW THE ACTIVITIES IN THE AREA OF BUSINESS AND HUMAN RIGHTS (COLOMBIA ETHICAL
COMMITMENTS AND GUIDELINES) IN COLOMBIA**

Madrid, december 10th 2015

www.sustentia.com
C/ Doña Juana I de Castilla, 60 - Bajo B
28027 Madrid
Telf. + 34 91 743 14 73

sustentia
innovación social

1.	Scope, Objectives, Operative Report and Techniques of the Evaluation	3
2.	Comparative analysis planned vs. actual working days.	7
3.	Financial Report	9
4.	Annexes	9

1. Scope, Objectives, Operative Report and Techniques of the Evaluation

Scope of the Evaluation

Sustentia Innovación Social was given the mandate to design and implement an external evaluation of the Swiss engagement in business and human rights issues in Colombia. From 2006 to 2015, the Swiss strategy has supported initiatives and facilitations directed at corporate responsibility, ethics and the protection of human rights in business. The two main initiatives that were developed through this strategy are *Compromiso Ético* (Ethical Commitment) (EC) and *Guías Colombia* (Colombia Guidelines) (CG), both funded by the Human Security Department (HSD) and led by *Fundación Ideas para la Paz* (FIP). In order to adequately assess the Swiss engagement over the course of the 10 years, the evaluation has also analysed other actions carried out by the Swiss Embassy in Bogotá, notably those concerning the facilitation of dialogue and conflict resolution.

- ***Compromiso Ético*** is an initiative started in 2011 by a group of Swiss companies operating in Colombia who, following an invitation from the Swiss Embassy in Bogota, made an official commitment to a joint project of incorporating Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law issues in their operations. Colombian NGOs participate in the initiative as observers.
- ***Guías Colombia*** is a multi-stakeholder initiative set up in 2006 that comprises businesses, civil society organisations and the Colombian government. Since its establishment, this group of stakeholders has been working on specifically agreed common areas of interest with the aim of improving the implementation of Human Rights and International Humanitarian Law issues in business operations in Colombia.

These two initiatives have been funded through 4 different projects as follows:

Project title	Private Sector code on security and human rights - development phase in Colombia	Guías Colombia en Seguridad y Derechos Humanos	Promoting and enhancing the work of companies in the business and human rights field in Colombia by strengthening both, <i>Guías Colombia</i> and the Swiss Ethical Commitment	Improving the implementation of business and human rights standards in Colombia: <i>Guías Colombia</i> and the Swiss Ethical Commitment
Initiative	<i>Guías Colombia</i>	<i>Guías Colombia</i>	<i>Guías Colombia + Compromiso Ético</i>	<i>Guías Colombia + Compromiso Ético</i>

Objectives of the Evaluation

The ToR defined the main objectives of this evaluation as follows:

- To analyse the validity of the Swiss Embassy's current approach to the B&HR issue in Colombia.
- To generate lessons learned & identify best practices from Swiss engagement in B&HR in Colombia.
- To serve as a basis for a strategy workshop on the Swiss engagement on B&HR in Colombia.

HSD and the Swiss Embassy also proposed 3 underlying assumptions from which the evaluation should depart:

- "Since EC and CG aim for an incremental process, the reality in the field could be transformed in the medium and long term. It may be that there are no measurable results in the short term".
- "Two paths have been developed to implement EC guidelines by participating companies: working on implementation as a group, or implementing them individually. Evidence on the implementation by companies outside of EC is still to be gathered".
- "The potential to create synergies with other initiatives in B&HR has been identified. Different Swiss agencies are involved in those initiatives".

Methodology and activities of the Evaluation

Even though the mandate did not include any baseline, *Sustentia* agreed with HSD to primarily focus on the three objectives and also on delivering an impact-assessment of the 2 main identified initiatives: *Compromiso Ético* and *Guías Colombia*.

Five criteria were used throughout the evaluation: Impact, Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, and Sustainability, these being internationally recognised criteria (OECD-DAC evaluation principles and SEVAL Standards). An Evaluation Matrix was built up following the two-level logic and adjusting those criteria and questions. Evaluation questions were also developed into sub-questions, indicators, sources of verification, techniques, reference sources and key informants. See Evaluation Matrix, (Annex I) and specific Questionnaires by Actor (Annex III).

This evaluation has mostly focused on the national effects of Swiss Intervention on Business and Human Rights (B&HR) in Colombia, with the relevant organisations interviewed being based in both capitals (Berne and Bogotá).

Phases and activities

The Inception Paper described the methodologies implemented throughout the 5 phases:

PHASE 1: DESK RESEARCH
PHASE 2: FIELD WORK
PHASE 3: PRELIMINARY REPORT WRITING
PHASE 4: STRATEGY DEVELOPMENT FACILITATION
PHASE 5: FINAL REPORT

➤ PHASE 1: DESK RESEARCH

Phase 1 lasted from July 21st to July 30th and was devoted to research and analysis of information gathered as indicated by HSD or as decided by the evaluation team.

In this phase the team involved were:

- Vidal Martin
- Mar Carneiro
- Carlos Cordero

Tasks carried out during this period included:

- Study of documentation (research and analysis).
- Inception paper (drafting and peer review).
- Desk research and review of materials (preparation for field trips: research on informants, selection of techniques, drafting of Evaluation Matrix)¹. This activity included also the time dedicated to the on-line questionnaires to the informants.

Deliverables: Inception paper (annex: Evaluation Matrix, Questionnaires by actor, Agenda of field work, and Document List) – 31 July 2015

The actual time dedicated in the activities of Desk Research was 20 working days, more than double of planned (8 working days).

¹ Full description of activities during this Phase 1 was described in the Inception Paper, delivered on July 31st 2015.

		W/D	W/D
PHASE 1: DESK RESEARCH	Study of documentation.	4	20
	Inception paper.	4	
	Interviews in Switzerland.	4	
	Desk research and materials.	8	

The ToR proposed an evaluation logic based on specific criteria. It also suggested the use of specific questions in the framework of every criterion selected. Taking these into account, *Sustentia* decided to follow the HSD approach, although minor changes were made in order to keep the evaluation feasible and guarantee an adequate triangulation of information.

In order to achieve all three aforementioned objectives, *Sustentia* structured a two-level evaluation grounded in a vertical logic (bottom-up), where both levels contained evaluation criteria similar to those proposed by the HSD. The evaluation structure fed Level 1 from answers gathered in Level 2, in a bottom-up logic as showed in Evaluation Matrix (Annex I). These relational and multidimensional analyses constitute a holistic and comprehensive perspective through which to evaluate Swiss Action in Colombia on B&HR.

Levels of evaluation

Level 1 - Swiss Strategy on B&HR in Colombia. This level focused on analysing the general Swiss engagement on B&HR in Colombia. It sought to inform decisions to be taken in the future by the Swiss government on B&HR for Colombia but also for other countries of action. This level has been fed by answers gathered from questions in Level 2.

Level 2 - Swiss Initiatives and facilitations on B&HR in Colombia. Level 2 was designed to analyse the three selected initiatives and to assess Swiss policy on B&HR in Colombia as a whole:

- Guías Colombia - GC
- Compromiso Ético - CE
- Two Swiss case-study facilitations in Colombia.

➤ PHASE 2: FIELD WORK

As expected, the Field Work was carried out in two phases, first in Switzerland (**September 15th and 16th** - Berne, Zürich) and then in Colombia (**September 28th to October 2nd** – Bogotá, Colombia). As showed in both Field Agendas (see Annex II), in order to collect the desired information and to be able to answer all evaluation questions, the following actions were carried out during the Field Work Phase, as follows:

SWITZERLAND (Zurich and Berne)	COLOMBIA (Bogotá)	Online
1 Focus Group	5 Focus Groups	11 Skype/phone interviews
7 Semi-structured interviews	6 Semi-structured interviews	50 sent Questionnaires
3 In-depth interviews	7 In-depth interviews	11 Persons interviewed
14 persons interviewed	41 Persons interviewed	6 replies (up to Oct 20 th)
Document analysis	Documentary analysis	

Questionnaire formats were tailored to the actor, and were designed and delivered both online and at Focus Groups, Semi-structured and In-depth interviews (see Annex III, Questionnaires). This

performance guaranteed triangulation of all gathered information. In total, 16 days were devoted to field meetings, conference calls and online questionnaire management, led by Carlos Cordero and Vidal Martín. 6 working days were dedicated to conference call with different actors and informants from Colombia and Switzerland.

PHASE 2: FIELD WORK	Mission to Colombia: research and interviews. Conference call with Colombia and Switzerland	16	16
----------------------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----	-----------

➤ PHASE 3: PRELIMINARY REPORT WRITING

The Preliminary Report was put together during October 5th-19th and was shared with HSD and other Swiss government agencies in Switzerland online, on 3th November 2015. Draft Report was presented in Colombia to HSD representatives and to the Swiss Embassy, on 5th of November 2015. No previous debriefing was done in Bern in this phase, but was spent more time, than planned, in drafting preliminary report. 10 days were dedicated in total in the 3rd phase.

PHASE 3: PRELIMINARY REPORT WRITING	Drafting of preliminary report	9	10
	Debriefing in Switzerland	0	
	Drafting of the report (to be presented in Colombia)	1	

Deliverables: Draft Preliminary Report – 3th November 2015

➤ PHASE 4: STRATEGY DEVELOPMENT FACILITATION

The Draft Report presentation in Colombia was presented on November 5th within the framework of a strategy development workshop facilitated by *Sustentia Innovación Social*. This workshop followed a Focus Group methodology agreed with HSD personnel, where main findings and conclusions were presented to the key Embassy staff. From the lessons learned specified in the Draft Report, a set of recommendations were developed and shared with the selected group. A participative methodology was used in determining the Draft Report topics to be discussed (specific findings, conclusions, lessons learned and recommendations). The evaluation team take note of the most relevant comments raised in the workshop by the participants and consider those in the revision of the Draft Preliminary Report.

Sustentia Innovación Social encouraged a constructive internal discussion and gather comments emerged from it. This workshop did aim to foster internal learning, stimulate reflection and facilitate decision-making processes.

The Draft Preliminary Report was reviewed to address the main comments raised in the Embassy strategic workshop and sent the new version to the HSD personnel. The time dedicated in this phase includes preparation and facilitation of the workshop in Bogota.

PHASE 4: STRATEGY DEVELOPMENT FACILITATION	Presentation of the report (in Colombia)	2	4
	Facilitation of strategy development workshop (in Colombia)	2	

Deliverables: Draft Preliminary Report reviewed – 16th November 2015; Presentation used in Bogota strategic workshop

➤ PHASE 5: FINAL REPORT

The evaluation team reflect upon workshop relevant debates and conclusions were included in the Final Report. Its structure and contents were debated with HSD and the Swiss Embassy in Bogota.

The final report was debriefed in Berne afterwards. Once presented, an executive summary of the most important findings was elaborated by *Sustentia Innovación Social*. The evaluation team took in account the comments in debrief activity in Berne and reviewed the report, specifically the executive Summary, and did a final version to be publish by HSD. At the end of the evaluation process and following consultation with the Swiss agencies, the executive summary will be published by HSD and the Embassy.

PHASE 5: FINAL REPORT	Draft final report	2	4
	Debriefing in Berne	2	

Techniques of information gathering

Semi-structured interview.- This technique followed a semi-structured path where the evaluator freely adds or shifts questions depending on the answers given.

In-depth interview.- Technique designed to analyse information from stakeholders not directly involved in the management of the initiatives and facilitations, but with a significant perspective due to their position. A free and spontaneous conversation based on a specific interview scheme.

Focus group.- Through the Focus Group technique, evaluators tried to highlight every participant opinion as well as how all of them interact with each other and with the rest of the group. Every Focus Group was made up of stakeholders from the same group.

Questionnaire.- Standardised interrogation with specific quantitative questions. Designed using the Survey Monkey platform, an easy-to-use online survey builder.

Documentary analysis.- Technique used to analyse primary and secondary sources of information regarding Swiss Cooperation on B&HR in Colombia. A detailed list of consulted sources was provided in the Inception Paper.

2. Comparative analysis planned vs. actual working days.

Planned and agreed: 30th working days

		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	W/D	W/D	WORKING DAYS
PHASE 1: DESK RESEARCH	Study of documentation.																															2	8	30
	Inception paper.																															2		
	Interviews in Switzerland.																															2		
	Desk research and materials.																															2		
PHASE 2: FIELD WORK	Mission to Colombia: research and interviews.																															8	8	
PHASE 3: PRELIMINARY REPORT WRITING	Drafting of preliminary report																															4	6	
	Debriefing in Switzerland																															1		
	Drafting of the report (to be presented in Colombia)																															1		
PHASE 4: STRATEGY DEVELOPMENT FACILITATION	Presentation of the report (in Colombia)																															2	4	
	Facilitation of strategy development workshop (in Colombia)																															2		
PHASE 5: FINAL REPORT	Draft final report																															2	4	
	Debriefing in Berne																															2		

Actual: 54th working days

		Actual		
		W/D	W/D	WORKING DAYS
PHASE 1: DESK RESEARCH	Study of documentation.	4	20	54
	Inception paper.	4		
	Interviews in Switzerland.	4		
	Desk research and materials.	8		
PHASE 2: FIELD WORK	Mission to Colombia: research and interviews. Conference call with Colombia and Switzerland	16	16	
PHASE 3: PRELIMINARY REPORT WRITTING	Drafting of preliminary report	9	10	
	Debriefing in Switzerland	0		
	Drafting of the report (to be presented in Colombia)	1		
PHASE 4: STRATEGY DEVELOPMENT FACILITATION	Presentation of the report (in Colombia)	2	4	
	Facilitation of strategy development workshop (in Colombia)	2		
PHASE 5: FINAL REPORT	Draft final report	2	4	
	Debriefing in Berne	2		
		54	54	

3. Financial Report

Offer accepted by HSD and Sustentia.

Planning in the contract agreed		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	W/D	W/D	WORKING DAYS AGREED
PHASE 1: DESK RESEARCH	Study of documentation.																															2	8	30
	Inception paper.																															2		
	Interviews in Switzerland.																															2		
	Desk research and materials.																															2		
PHASE 2: FIELD WORK	Mission to Colombia: research and interviews.																															8	8	
PHASE 3: PRELIMINARY REPORT WRITING	Drafting of preliminary report																															4	6	
	Debriefing in Switzerland																															1		
	Drafting of the report (to be presented in Colombia)																															1		
PHASE 4: STRATEGY DEVELOPMENT FACILITATION	Presentation of the report (in Colombia)																															2	4	
	Facilitation of strategy development workshop (in Colombia)																															2		
PHASE 5: FINAL REPORT	Draft final report																															2	4	
	Debriefing in Berne																															2		
																																30	30	Total FEES/ CHF
																																14,421.43		

Remuneration:

30 working days agreed, with a fee per day of 480,71 CHF, is a **Total of 14,421.43 CHF**

Working day fee agreed in the evaluation contract:

Special fee/working day
480,71 CHF

Travel Expenses:

Spends included in the contract regarding **Lump sum per day** in Colombia and Switzerland are: **771 CHF**

The rest of travel expenses (hotel and flights) have been covered directly by the HSD in Switzerland or the Swiss Embassy in Colombia

Total payment: **15,192. 43 CHF**

4. Annexes

(See all documents attached)

- **Annex I.- Evaluation Matrix**

- **Annex II.- Field Agendas**

Annex II.a Agenda in Switzerland (Zurich and Berne)

Annex II.b Agenda in Colombia (Bogota)

- **Annex III.- Questionnaires by Actor**

Annex III.a Questionnaire by Actor

Annex III.b General Questionnaire in Switzerland (Zurich and Berne)

Annex III.c General Questionnaire in Colombia (Bogota)

- **Annex V.- Online Questionnaire**

- **Annex VI.- Evaluation outcomes presentation in Bogota (including National and international B&HR context)**